
AGENDA ITEM No. 2

MINUTES

<u>Meeting:</u>	Planning Committee
<u>Date:</u>	11 October 2013 at 10.00 am
<u>Venue:</u>	The Board Room, Aldern House, Baslow Road, Bakewell
<u>Chair:</u>	Clr Mrs L C Roberts
<u>Present:</u>	Mr P Ancell, Miss P Beswick, Clr D Birkinshaw, Clr P Brady, Clr C Carr, Clr D Chapman, Clr A Favell, Clr Mrs H M Gaddum, Clr Mrs N Hawkins, Clr H Laws, Mr G Nickolds, Mr C Pennell, Clr Mrs K Potter, Clr P Rippon, Clr Mrs J A Twigg. Clr Ms E Wilcox
<u>Apologies for Absence:</u>	None

143/13 MINUTES

The minutes of the meeting held on 13 September 2013 were approved as a correct record subject to minute 128/13 being amended to reflect that Clr Mrs K Potter was no longer a member of English Heritage and minute 138/13 being amended to replace the words "social" to "sustainable".

Clr Mrs K Potter asked that her vote against approval of the minutes be recorded.

144/13 PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

10 members of the public had given notice to speak at the meeting.

145/13 MEMBERS' DECLARATION OF INTERESTS

The following Members declared an interest in items on the agenda:

Item 6

- Miss P Beswick, personal prejudicial interest as she was a resident of Chapel Row, Curbar and had raised objection to the application.
- It was noted that all members had a personal interest in this item as they knew Miss Beswick as a Member of the Authority.

Item 10

- Mrs J A Twigg, personal interest as she had met with the applicant as a member of Derbyshire County Council.
- It was noted that Clr A Favell had received correspondence from the applicant.
- It was noted that as John Scott, Director of Planning, had worked for the applicant before joining the Authority he would leave the room during consideration of this item.

Item 11

- Clr E Wilcox, personal as she was a member of Derbyshire County Council who had submitted representations on this item.

Item 12

- Clr Mrs J A Twigg, personal as she knew one of the objectors who had given her information which she had passed on to the Chair of the Committee. Clr L Roberts confirmed that she had passed this information on to the Director of Planning.

Item 14

- Clr D Chapman, personal as he was acquainted with the applicant.
- Clr P Brady, personal prejudicial as he was related to the applicant through marriage.

Item 15

- Mr C Pennell, personal, Chair of Heritage Lottery Fund in East Midlands which provided funding for the project.

Item 16

- Clr E Wilcox, personal as she had been appointed as a heritage champion for English Heritage by Derbyshire County Council.
- Miss P Beswick, Mr C Pennell and Clr H Laws, personal as members of English Heritage.
- Mr C Pennell, personal as the property was owned by the Authority.

Item 17

- Clr P Brady, personal as he had been involved in pursuing an enforcement matter for 6 years.
- Clr D Chapman, personal prejudicial in discussions on 5 Acres Farm as he was a friend of the owner of the site. It was noted that he would leave the room if this enforcement case was discussed.
- It was noted that all Members had received emails from the Clerk to Winster Parish Council on matters relating to Lower Westhills Farm, Winster.

146/13 6. FULL APPLICATION – DEMOLITION OF INDUSTRIAL SHED BUILDING AND ERECTION OF A PRIVATE DWELLING HOUSE, COAL AND HAULAGE DEPOT SITE, MOORLANDS LANE FROGGATT, (NP/DDD/0113/0058, P.8536 + 9681, 24.01.2013, 424395 376306/KW)

The Head of Law reminded the meeting that Miss P Beswick had declared a personal prejudicial interest in this item and, although she would address the Committee as a public speaker, she would leave the room after speaking and would not participate in consideration of the application.

The Planning Officer reported that condition 12 had been amended to add the words “including ancillary out buildings” and clarified that highways conditions were as follows:

- Provide space for construction vehicles for parking storage and servicing

- purposes
- Provide and maintain off-street parking facilities
- Access not to be gated within 5 metres of the highway
- Bin storage to be clear of the parking and turning areas
- No caravans or other non-domestic vehicles parked on the designated parking areas.
- Footnotes about not carrying materials on to the highway, surface drainage and notification of the works to the relevant highway departments.

It was noted that this application had been the subject of a site visit.

The following spoke under the Public Participation Scheme:

- Miss P Beswick, Objector
- Mr Richard Owen, Objector
- Mr Jeff Sowerby, Agent

A motion to refuse was moved, seconded, voted upon and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be REFUSED for the following reasons:

- 1. Inappropriate scale, size, form, massing and detailing that would not represent enhancement of the site and its surroundings**
- 2. The proposed dwelling would not preserve or enhance the character of the conservation area and the village.**
- 3. The dwelling is considered to be unneighbourly and would adversely impact upon the residential amenities of the adjacent dwellings to the south and west.**

Miss P Beswick returned to the meeting following consideration of this item

147/13 7. FULL APPLICATION FOR THE DEMOLITION OF AN EXISTING DWELLING AND ERECTION OF A NEW EARTH SHELTERED DWELLING AT THE BUNGALOW, HIGHCLIFFE, EYAM (NP/DDD/0313/0196, P1558, 11/03/2013 421602/377351 TC)

It was noted that this application had been the subject of a site visit.

The Planning Officer provided clarification on the following conditions:

1. 3 year time limit for commencement
2. Amended plans had been received
3. Materials to be agreed – limestone is referred to in report but gritstone is more appropriate for that location
9. Precautionary and enhancement measures relate to protected species referred to in report

The following spoke under the Public Participation Scheme:

- Andrew Schofield, agent

The recommendation to approve was moved, seconded, voted upon and carried subject a precondition to include the making of an area Tree Preservation Order to protect landscaping and screening on the site.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to the making of an area Tree Preservation Order and the following conditions:

- 1. Statutory 3 year time limit for commencement**
- 2. Development to be in accordance with amended plans**
- 3. Materials to be gritstone.**
- 4. Retain existing boundary trees and hedging**
- 5. Pointing**
- 6. Windows and doors – details to be provided**
- 7. Minor design modifications relating to form and profile of and treatment of glazed areas/stone walling.**
- 8. Withdraw permitted development rights for alterations, extensions, porches, ancillary buildings, walls, fences and satellite dishes**
- 9. Adopt precautionary and enhancement measures for protected species referred to in the report**
- 10. Tree mitigation measures**
- 11. Highway requirements – maintain existing level of off-street parking/manoeuvring clear of any obstruction.**
- 12. Submit and agree full details of environmental management measures**
- 13. Submit and agree scheme of landscaping**

The meeting was adjourned from 11.20am to 11.30am following consideration of this item.

- 148/13 8. FULL APPLICATION – ERECTION OF NEW HOUSE (PASSIVHAUS) TO REPLACE EXISTING BUNGALOW, 30 CASTLETON ROAD, HOPE (NP/HPK/0413/0249, P.8009, 18.4.2013, 416977 383535/KW)**

The following spoke under the Public Participation Scheme:

- Mr Richard Carter, Applicant

The recommendation for approval was moved, seconded, voted upon and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED, subject to the following conditions:

- 1. Statutory 3 year time period for commencement**
- 2. Agree amended plans.**

3. **Natural materials throughout, including a natural blue slate roof.**
4. **All window openings to be provided with full natural gritstone lintels and sills.**
5. **Minor design conditions.**
6. **Erect section of 2.0m high fence along eastern boundary prior to occupation of the dwelling.**
7. **Submit and agree landscaping scheme.**
8. **Withdraw p.d. rights for alterations, extensions, porches, ancillary buildings, walls, fences and satellite dishes.**
9. **Submit and agree scheme of appropriate environmental management measures.**
10. **Retain garaging and vehicle parking/manoeuvring space.**
11. **Submit and agree any details of spoil removal arising from the demolition works.**
12. **Maintain obscure glazing.**

The Director of Planning left the room at 11.50am following consideration of this item.

149/13 9 FULL APPLICATION – RETROSPECTIVE APPLICATION FOR THE ERECTION OF A LAMBING SHED AND SHELTER AND APPLICATION TO COMPLETE THE DEVELOPMENT INCLUDING RENDERING OF WALLS, INSTALLATION OF A GATE AND FORMATION OF A STONE HARDSTANDING ON FIELD TO THE SOUTH OF BUXTON ROAD (A6187), CASTLETON (NP/HPK/0213/0124, P6630, 29/08/2013, 414803/382948/AC)

The following spoke under the Public Participation Scheme:

- Mr Kenneth Wainman, agent

The recommendation for approval was moved, seconded, voted upon and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED, subject to the following conditions:

1. **The development hereby permitted shall not be carried out otherwise than in complete accordance with the approved plans (Dwg No: 08-02 Sheet Dated Jan 2013 and 08-03 Sheet Dated Feb 2013) and specifications, subject to the following conditions or modifications.**
2. **Prior to the development being brought into use, the walls of the building shall be rendered with a dry limestone dashed finish.**
3. **The building hereby permitted shall only be used for agriculture and when it is no longer required for the purposes of agriculture it shall be dismantled, removed from the site and the site shall be restored to its former levels and reseeded to form additional grazing land.**

150/13 10. FULL APPLICATION FOR THE EXTENSION OF EXISTING MANUFACTURING BUILDING AND DIVERSION OF EXISTING PUBLIC FOOTPATH AT BUXO PLAS, QUARTERS FARM, HAZELBADGE (NP/DDD/0613/0542 P.11424, 417283/379374, TC)

John Scott, Director of Planning, left the room during consideration of this item as he had carried out work for the applicant before becoming an employee of the Authority.

It was noted that this application had been the subject of a site visit.

The following spoke under the Public Participation Scheme:

- Mr Nick Marriott, Agent

It was noted that the Authority's Conservation Archaeologist had looked at the site and had not raised any objection to the proposals on archaeological grounds.

As Members felt that in this case there was overriding justification for development within open countryside, a motion for approval subject to conditions was moved, seconded, voted upon and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to a section 106 agreement tying the extension to existing buildings on the site and the adjoining 115 acres of farmland and the following conditions:

- 1. Statutory 3 year commencement**
- 2. Adopt submitted plans**
- 3. Extension to be used solely for purposes related to the existing plastic extrusion business on the site with no subletting or separate sale.**
- 4. Sheeting for roof and doors to be dark green to match existing buildings on the site.**
- 5. External timberwork to be stained dark brown.**
- 6. Exposed areas of concrete block on the north side to be finished with a render and lime dash finish.**
- 7. Submission of an alternative landscaping scheme including omission of the timber fencing in favour of a drystone wall and to include full details of any retaining walls and other structures.**
- 8. No outside storage of materials.**
- 9. Submit and agree details of use of spoil arising from the excavation.**
- 10. Condition to limit hours of operation and travel movements to be discussed with applicant and agreed by the Planning Team Manager in consultation with the Chair and Vice-Chair of the Committee.**
- 11. Submit and agree scheme of external lighting.**

12. Submission and approval of scheme of water management on site.

The Director of Planning returned to the meeting following consideration of this item.

151/13 11. FULL APPLICATION – CHANGE OF USE OF PART OF DISUSED QUARRY TO 30-VAN TOURING CARAVAN SITE, PINDALE QUARRY, PINDALE ROAD, HOPE, (NP/DDD/0411/0370, P.5734 + 3926B, 23.5.2013, 416039 382407/KW)

The Chair reported that this application had been withdrawn by the applicant.

152/13 12. FULL APPLICATION FOR THE DEMOLITION OF EXISTING BUILDING AND ERECTION OF A NEW DWELLING, FORMATION OF NEW VEHICULAR ACCESS AND CHANGE OF USE OF LAND TO FACILITATE FORMATION OF THE NEW ACCESS AT OLD NELLY'S, HIGH STREET, STONEY MIDDLETON (NP/DDD/0813/0746 P.10254 & 3818, 422788/375434, TC)

It was noted that this application had been the subject of a site visit.

The following spoke under the Public Participation Scheme:

- Dr P Owens, objector
- Mr M Games, Stoney Middleton Parish Council, objector

The Planning Officer read out correspondence received from the applicant who had been unable to attend the meeting.

A motion to defer consideration of this item was moved, seconded, voted upon and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be DEFERRED to allow further discussion with the applicant on submitting revised plans including alternative proposals for the parking of vehicles on site.

In accordance with Standing Orders Members considered whether to extend the meeting beyond 1pm. The motion to continue was moved, seconded, voted upon and carried.

RESOLVED

That the meeting continue beyond 1pm.

The meeting adjourned for lunch between 1.15pm and 1.50pm.

Chair: Clr Mrs L C Roberts

Present: Mr P Ancell, Miss P Beswick, Clr D Birkinshaw, Clr P Brady, Clr C Carr, Clr D Chapman, Clr A Favell, Clr Mrs H M Gaddum, Clr Mrs N Hawkins, Clr H Laws, Mr G Nickolds, Mr C Pennell, Clr Mrs K Potter, Clr Mrs J A Twigg, Clr Ms E Wilcox

Apologies for Absence: Clr P Rippon

153/13 13. FULL APPLICATION – CHANGE OF USE FROM A TELEPHONE EXCHANGE TO HOLIDAY LET AND INSTALLATION OF ROOFLIGHTS AND SIDE WINDOW,

PARSLEY HAY TELEPHONE EXCHANGE, PARSLEY HAY (NP/DDD/0713/0571, P.7997, 414638 / 363758. 24/09/2013/AM).

The following spoke under the Public Participation Scheme:

- Mr James Butterworth, Architect on behalf of the applicant.

It was noted that on page 8 of the report the holiday let occupancy condition restricts occupancy of the accommodation for any one person to 28 days in one calendar year rather than restricting the use of the entire holiday let to only 28 days in any one calendar year

The recommendation for approval was moved and seconded, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions:

- 1. The proposed development shall be commenced within 3 years**
- 2. Development not to be carried out otherwise than in accordance with specified amended / approved plans.**
- 3. Prior approval of foul water drainage details to be implemented as part of the development.**
- 4. Prior approval of detailed scheme of landscaping to be implemented as part of the development.**
- 5. Any new services to be placed underground.**
- 6. Restrict external lighting.**
- 7. Prior approval of colour and finish to the external walls of the building to be implemented as part of the development.**
- 8. Conditions to specify architectural and design details for the holiday let including, joinery details and roof lights.**
- 9. Holiday occupancy restriction applied to future occupancy of converted building.**
- 10. Removal of permitted development rights for external alterations and extensions to converted building.**
- 11. Development to be carried out in accordance with recommendations of submitted Environmental Assessment report.**
- 12. Before any other operations are commenced a new vehicular access shall be created in accordance with the approved plans and provided with visibility splays in accordance with Highways Authority's recommendations and maintained in perpetuity.**
- 13. Before any other operations are commenced, excluding condition 12, the existing access shall be permanently closed by the erection of dry stone walling in accordance with the approved plans.**

14. Before any other operations are commenced, excluding conditions 12 and 13, space shall be provided within the site curtilage for the storage of plant, materials, manoeuvring and parking to be maintained throughout the duration of construction works.
15. The holiday accommodation shall not be occupied until parking and manoeuvring space has been provided in accordance with the approved plans and shall be maintained in perpetuity.
16. The access shall not be gated within 5m of the highway limits and any gates shall open inwards only.

154/13 14. SECTION 73 APPLICATION – REMOVAL OR VARIATION OF CONDITIONS 2, 3, 4, 6, 7, 10, 14, 15, 16, 17, 24 and 25 FROM APPLICATION NP/DDD/0510/0510, FOLD FARM, MAIN STREET, TADDINGTON (NP/DDD/0713/0561, P.10599, 414462 / 371029, 30/08/2013/AM).

The Head of Law reminded the Committee that Cllr D Chapman had declared a personal interest in this application as he was acquainted with the applicant and Cllr P Brady, had declared a personal prejudicial interest as he was related to the applicant through marriage. Cllr P Brady left the meeting during consideration of this item.

The Planning Officer reported the following amendments to the report:

Page 8 final sentence of paragraph 7 should read “This is because insensitive alterations to the buildings would detract from their character and appearance, which would completely undermine the point of allowing them to be converted to dwellings.”

Page 9 second paragraph delete “not” at the beginning of the final sentence

The recommendation for approval was moved and seconded subject to an additional condition 15, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions or modifications:

1. The development to be carried out in accordance with specified approved plans.
2. Access to be modified in accordance with approved site plan before the commencement of any other operation on site and permanently so maintained thereafter.
3. Parking and manoeuvring space to be provided in accordance with the approved site plan prior to the occupation of any dwelling house and permanently so maintained thereafter.
4. Development shall be completed in accordance with approved schedule of energy saving measures and permanently so maintained thereafter.
5. Prior to the occupation of any of the five approved dwellings, the walls, floor and roof forming the second storey of the two storey extension on the northern elevation of Barn B shall be completely demolished and the development shall then not be carried out other than in complete

accordance with approved plans.

6. **Within 3 months of the date of this permission any plastic rainwater goods that have been installed shall be removed and any new rainwater goods shall be cast metal painted black and shall be permanently maintained thereafter.**
7. **The window on the northern elevation of Cottage A & B shall be obscurely glazed at the time of erection and shall have a fixed non-opening frame.**
8. **Conditions to specify architectural and design details for the uncompleted parts of the development including stonework, roof materials, joinery details and verge finish.**
9. **Services shall be undergrounded and shall be completed in accordance with the approved site plan.**
10. **Remove permitted development rights for extensions, alterations, ancillary buildings, satellite antenna, solar or photovoltaic panels, gates, fences walls or other forms of boundary enclosure.**
11. **Existing steel lean to building shown on submitted plan to be completely demolished and removed from the site prior to the occupation of any of the five approved dwelling houses.**
12. **Outdoor amenity spaces shown on approved site plan shall be defined with dry stone walls prior to the occupation of any dwelling house.**
13. **Hard landscaping works shown on approved site plan shall be carried out prior to the occupation of any dwelling house and shall be permanently so maintained thereafter.**
14. **Hedge and grass planting shown on the approved site plan shall be carried out prior to the occupation of any dwelling house and shall be permanently maintained.**
15. **Notwithstanding the submitted plans the windows shown in the east facing elevation of the single story extension shall be omitted and replaced with stone infill to match the surrounding stone.**

The Planning Committee asked the Director of Planning to relay to the applicant their anger regarding the flouting of the conditions which led to this application.

Clr P Brady returned to the meeting at 2.25pm following consideration of this item

155/13 15. ADVERTISEMENT CONSENT APPLICATION – PROPOSED INTERPRETIVE PANEL FOR THE CALVER WEIR RESTORATION PROJECT AT STOCKING FARM, CALVER (NP/DDD/0713/0625, P.1404, 18/07/2013, 424608 / 374696, MN)

The Head of Law reminded Members that Mr C Pennell had declared a personal interest as Chair of Heritage Lottery Fund in the East Midlands Committee.

The recommendation for approval was moved and seconded, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions :

- 1. Standard advertisement regulations conditions**
- 2. Completion in accordance with submitted plans**

156/13 16. LISTED BUILDING CONSENT – INSTALLATION OF NEW INTERNAL BOILER AND EXTERNAL FLUE – NORTH LEES HALL, HATHERSAGE (NP/DDD/0613/0450, P.6193, 4/7/2013, 423536 / 383448, MN)

It was noted that all Members had a personal interest in this matter as members of the National Park Authority who own the building.

The recommendation for approval was moved and seconded, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions:

- 1. Statutory 3 year time limit to commence works**
- 2. Completion in full accordance with submitted plans**
- 3. Wire flue guard to be dark brown in colour and to project no more than 300mm from the face of the louvred window.**

Clr Mrs N Hawkins left the meeting from 2.30 to 2.35pm during consideration of this item.

157/13 17. MONITORING AND ENFORCEMENT QUARTERLY REVIEW – OCTOBER 2013 (A.1533/AJC)

It was noted that all members had received correspondence from Winster Parish Council on matters relating to Lower Westhills Farm, Winster. Clr Mrs Gaddum, Clr Mrs K Potter, Councillor Mrs L Roberts and Clr Mrs J Twigg declared personal interests as they knew the clerk to Winster Parish Council, Mr R Greatorex, when he was a member of the Authority

The Head of Law reminded the Committee that Clr P Brady had declared a personal interest as he had been involved in pursuing an enforcement matter for 6 years and that Clr D Chapman had a personal prejudicial interest in discussions on 5 Acres Farm as he was a friend of the owner of the site.

The Monitoring & Enforcement Manager highlighted the statistical charts in the report which demonstrated that the Authority's performance on enforcement had continued to improve with the current number of outstanding cases at the lowest level since December 2010.

Members received updates and discussed the following high priority cases:

- Midfield, Kettlethulme
- Home Farm Sheldon
- Fernhill Cottage, Hollow Meadows
- Lower Westhills Farm, Winster.

In considering the high priority enforcement case at Lower Westhills Farm, Winster the Monitoring & Enforcement Manager displayed some 'before' and 'after' photographs and pointed out some of the items that remained on site in breach of the injunction order. The Committee noted the concerns of the Parish Council, but in light of the significant improvements on the site, supported the officer proposal to close this case.

RESOLVED:

That the report be noted.

Clr P Brady and Clr Mrs N Hawkins left the meeting at 2.45pm during consideration of this item.

158/13 18. PLANNING APPEALS (A.1536/AMC)

RESOLVED:

That the report be noted.

The meeting ended at 2.55pm.